

**REPORT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMITTEE ON RESULTS OF
ASSESSMENT OF COMPLIANCE WITH STANDARDS FOR INSTITUTIONAL
ACCREDITATION OF ORGANISATIONS FOR
CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT (CPD)
FOR HEALTHCARE PROFESSIONALS**

"MEDICAL ACADEMY OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION" LLP

1. Composition of External Expert Committee

In accordance with the order of the ECA No. 30 dated 10.04.2019 formed External Expert Committee (EEC) for the activity evaluation of "Medical Academy of Postgraduate Education" for compliance with Standards for Institutional Accreditation of Organisations for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for healthcare professionals, as follows:



Chairman of the External Expert Commission

KARIBAEVA DINA ORYNBASAROVNA

Candidate of Medical Sciences, Head of the department of general practice of JSC "National Medical University"

Tel. + 77773702070

e-mail: dinkarib@mail.ru



Foreign expert

TILEKEEVA ULANKUL MUKTAROVNA

M.D., Professor

Head of the Department of Basic and Clinical Pharmacology of the I.K. Ahunbaev Kyrgyz State Medical Academy

Tel. + 996770773898

e-mail: ulangul@mail.ru



National academic expert

ZHANTELIEVA LAZZAT ASANOVNA

M.D, Deputy Director of

"International Institute for Postgraduate Education" LLP

tel. + 77073762818

e-mail: zhantelieva@gmail.com



Judge - representative of practical health

ZHUNUSOVA AYNUR ZHANALIEVNA

Deputy chief medical officer

RSE REM Republican educational and health center
"Baldauren"

tel. + 77011224080

e-mail: zhunusova.ainur@mail.ru



Expert - listener

RAKHMANOV MARAT ADILHANOVICH

M.D., PhD, a pediatric surgeon

RSE REM "Center for Children's emergency medical care"

Tel. +77027804975



ECAQA observer

UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA

Head of accreditation and monitoring NU "Eurasian Centre
for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education
and Health care"

Tel. +77475609212, info@ecaqa.org

The EEC report contains an assessment of "Medical Academy of Postgraduate Education" LLP on compliance with the Standards for Institutional Accreditation of Organisations for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for healthcare professionals ECAQA, the EEC recommendations for further improvement.

2. General part of the final report of the EEC

2.1 Presentation of "Medical Academy of Postgraduate Education" LLP

"Medical Academy of Postgraduate Education" LLP (hereinafter - MAPE) is the successor of "Institute of Continuing Medical Education" LLP (ICME), has been operating from February 13, 2014 till December 31, 2017. Institute of Continuing Medical Education provides educational services in the following areas: training and retraining of specialists in the country, the countries of near and far abroad; training of health professionals in the field training, workshops, trainings, seminars of leading experts of the country, and abroad; training of specialists in the simulation center.

During the period of operation in INMO: a quality management system has been developed and implemented in accordance with the requirements of quality standards ISO 9001: 2015; in April 2016 INMO was successfully certified by the company "SGS Kazakhstan Ltd" and received an international certificate SAS - Switzerland. In March 2017 passed the recertification of the QMS.

In 2017, ICME was recognized by the National Business Rating as the leader in education and won the gold rating among the enterprises of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the nomination "Development Dynamics".

From 2018 to the legal status of the organization MAPS provides advanced professional competence and retraining of workers of the Republic of Kazakhstan health care, training with international standards, innovative technologies in the areas of health, improvement of practical skills using simulation technology, training of health professionals in leading clinics abroad. MAPS provides educational services in the following areas: training and retraining of specialists with higher and secondary medical and pharmaceutical education; workshops, trainings, seminars; paramedic training.

MAPE operates in accordance with the purposes and objectives of the Strategic Development Plan, including:

- 1) Providing high quality training of competent, competitive, possessing innovative technologies, knowledge of health professionals who can provide high quality and safe medical services in modern conditions.
- 2) Constructing an effective and sustainable corporate governance.
- 3) Improvement of educational activities with the introduction of innovative technologies.

On the basis of the Contract No.08 / 74 dated December 22, 2018, MAPE rents an isolated area of 336.5 square meters, where there are classrooms, a testing center, simulation center. MAPE is equipped with office equipment, office furniture, telephones, connected to the Internet. Material and technical base MAPE meet modern requirements.

The educational process is carried out 59 teachers, of them have scientific degrees of candidates - 25, M.D. - 11, PhD - 9, Master of Public Health - 6, Master of International Law - 1. Categorization of the teaching staff - 85%.

The number of full units according MAPE staffing in 2019 - 13.0. Number of employed staff units (basic) on 05.01.2019 year - 11.0. The number of part-time workers (faculty) - 53 people. The average age of employees is 44 years..

It operates its own website www.mapo.kz That informs on services, resources, news in the MAPE.

Information and Library Support of the educational process is conducted in MAPS under a contract with the Republican Intercollegiate electronic library (RMEB) <http://rmebrk.kz/> the web-portal RMEB.

2.2 Information about previous accreditation

As an organization engaged in the continuous professional development of health professionals, "Medical Academy of Postgraduate Education" LLP has not been accredited.

2.3 Analysis of the self-assessment report of "Medical Academy of Postgraduate Education" LLP for compliance with Institutional Accreditation Standards organizations of additional education (continuous professional development)

Report on the institutional self-evaluation "Medical Academy of Postgraduate Education" LLP (hereinafter - MAPE) for compliance with Institutional Accreditation Standards of additional education institutions (continuous professional development) presented on 93 pages, including attachments, is characterized by completeness, structuring and internal unity of the information provided by the accredited organization of its activities. A cover letter signed by the Director Ibrayeva K.E. is attached to the report, confirming the authenticity of the information and data contained in the report.

The report was prepared in accordance with the Guidelines for self-assessment and in full compliance with the institutional accreditation of the ECAQA. There is a list of members of the internal committee self-assessment indicating the responsibility of each member of the internal commission (only 10 people), information about MAPS representative responsible for the conduct of institutional self - Ibraeva Aisha Shaykovna, M.D., MPH, deputy director. The chairman of the steering committee, consisting of 9 working groups for preparing for institutional accreditation, is also Ibraeva A.Sh.

Institutional self –assessment of MAPE carried out after the conclusion of the agreement with the ECAQA No.18 dated 30.01.2019 and of the working group was formed to prepare for accreditation for compliance with institutional accreditation standards organizations of additional education (continuous professional development).

Working Group to prepare a report on self-assessment has been done some work: analyzes the key activities and tasks for the implementation of programs of additional education, gather the necessary information in accordance with the standards of institutional accreditation; a thorough analysis of teaching and learning materials, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the self-assessment report is structured in accordance with institutional Accreditation Standards includes a description of the ECAQA and strengths, areas for improvement in each of the 9 standard.

Applications are represented in the form of copies of licenses, certificates and achievements MAPE, tables and figures are cited in the text. The report is written in competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable.

3. Analysis of compliance with the standards of institutional accreditation of the external evaluation of "Medical Academy of Postgraduate Education" LLP for compliance with institutional accreditation standards organizations of additional education (continuous professional development) and an overview of the strengths of each standard

Standard 1: Mission and Outcomes

Mission of MAPE has been identified in the strategic plan of the organization, which was approved by 02.01.2018 year. Mission linked to the long-term strategic development plan of the organization and ensuring the quality of educational services in the preparation of practical public health specialists. In the development of the mission attended MAPE teachers, students, employers' representatives and staff of the organization. The participation of the team of employees, students in the discussion of the mission and goals was held in accordance with the existing procedure, ensuring the involvement of all stakeholders, both in the planning and execution of the decisions taken.

WEC when visiting MAPE received evidence implementation of this standard in the form of awareness of teachers of the mission, students, employers, mission placing resources in social networks and on the organization's website. Each student in the first class met with teaching materials, which included the mission and outcomes in a specific discipline or training program.

Strengths Standard 1 of the external evaluation:

1. The presence of the mission, developed with the participation of all stakeholders: faculty, students, employers and individuals, defining health policies;
2. The final results are monitored, discussed and taken into consideration when making strategic decisions; if appropriate changes are made.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply - 13 partially comply - 0 do not comply - 0

Standard 1: Completed

Recommendations for improvement: no

Standard 2: Educational programmes

Educational programs are developed according to the model programs of training and retraining of medical and pharmaceutical personnel. Determination of AT needs on the basis of applications from medical organizations and individual students. MAPE holds status lasting from 54 to 216 hours, training duration from 432 to 1080 hours.

The EEC as a result of a program of visits and visit MAPE at 4 clinical base, the presence of a few practice sessions, received evidence that the accredited organization has implemented all forms of additional education and uses a variety of innovative teaching methods.

Strengths of Standard 2 of the external evaluation:

1. Flexibility and individual approach in the development of training programs to meet the needs of students and employers, affordable.
2. Apply a variety of teaching methods that satisfy the expectations of students and aimed at improving knowledge and skills.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply - 17 partially comply -2 do not comply - 0.

Standard 2: Completed

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To improve the organization of the educational process:
 - Certified teachers in active learning methods (TBL, PBL, CBL) and testology (MCQ);
 - To strengthen the work with employers to improve the content of educational programs;
 - In revising educational programs take into account the opinion of students according to their individual plans.

Standard 3: Assessment and documentation of CPD

The MAPE, as an organization implementing additional education programs, the Policy for assessing the quality of the implementation of working curricula for continuing professional development has been developed and implemented (SC protocol No. 4 dated April 25, 2018).

The main forms and methods of evaluation of MAPE activities in the field of the CPD is the feedback, taking into account the views of the audience at the survey and the survey in order to identify the degree of satisfaction with the quality of education and conditions of teaching staff certification. Held monitoring the effective planning and allocation of resources by adjusting and evaluate the effectiveness of the processes.

The EEC validated the results of the standard by examining the documentation of the assessment of students (journals, texts, statements) and interviews with the students, which clearly showed that the MAPE implemented different methods of evaluation and an appropriate document issued upon completion (license, certificate, certificate). MAPE should regulating documents (orders) in the region RoK additional education.

Strengths Standard 3 of the external evaluation:

1. Availability of current policy evaluation of the educational program in the MAPE.
2. The involvement of health professionals in all stages of program planning, development, implementation, evaluation and monitoring.

EEC conclusions on criteria comply - 6 partially comply -1 do not comply - 0

Standard 3: Completed

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To strengthen the methodological work:
 - To develop and implement a single form educational complex specialty and educational-methodical documentation of the organization;
 - To develop uniform criteria for assessing learning outcomes of end students.

Standard 4: The health professionals (individual professional development)

The EEC members received evidence that MAPE conducts training cycles for health professionals in the provision of high-tech medical care and non-medical staff for emergency assistance. MAPE is widely used for the convenience of visiting students refresher courses, certification workshops and short-term seminars and trainings. As a

result of interviews with the students the experts found that the students receive information about training programs from different sources of information and they are satisfied with an individual approach to learning, the formation of groups of students, class schedules and place of the practical training.

Strengths Standard 4 of the external evaluation:

1. High level of satisfaction of students with the quality and content of educational programs (94%).
2. Demand for advanced training and training programs from both health care professionals and paramedics.
3. Commitment of employers to programs for Academic staff of MAPE.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply - 19 partially comply - 0 do not comply - 0

Standard 4: Completed

Recommendations for improvement: no

Standard 5: CPD Provision (continuous professional development)

When visiting the MAPE external experts verified the implementation of this standard as accredited organization ensures effective implementation of services for the advanced training and retraining cycles. The experts were convinced that the workers improve training and retraining cycle programs are designed in accordance with a model curriculum on the basis of the analysis of the health needs of the organization. In accordance with the lists provided by the experts called for the implementation of CPD programs teaching staff is professional, experienced, has the patents, copyrights, intellectual property.

In implementing the program the RT and AT met requirements for activities - the availability of the material, presentation (use of electronic whiteboard, audio and video technology, the use of plaster casts), the distribution of materials in electronic and paper form, an adequate assessment of knowledge and skills, compliance with ethical and legal standards.

To strengthen partnerships abroad MAPE initiates national and international collaboration with leading clinics and universities.

Strengths Standard 5 of the external evaluation:

1. The focus of teachers on the practical application of the knowledge and skills gained by students in training in MAPE.
2. By example teachers motivate students to learn throughout life.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply - 12 partially comply - 0 do not comply - 0

Standard 5: Completed

Recommendations for improvement:

- 1) To implement electronic workflow.

Standard 6: Educational Resources

The EEC members examined the logistical and educational resources of MAPE, visit the main office, including the audience, administrative offices, simulation center, as well as visiting 4 of the 7-year clinical bases of the organization. Classrooms are

equipped with multimedia computers. Organized service with ongoing access to electronic resources for staff and students. The MAPE has a simulation center for training of practical skills and prepare students to pass the skills on the qualifying exam. Realizing the main directions of its activity, MAPE has its own website www.mapo.kz, which informs about the services provided, resources, news in the work of MAPO. There is a corporate mail mapoalmaty@gmail.com. There is a watsapp, instagram. https://www.instagram.com/mapo_kz/ Facebook <https://www.facebook.com/mapoalmaty>.

Strengths Standard 6 of the external evaluation:

1. Availability of material, technical and resource base sufficient for quality supplementary education.
2. Active and effective cooperation with medical and international organizations within the framework of agreements and memorandums.
3. Access to republican and international information resources for students and teachers.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply - 24 partially comply - 0 do not comply - 0

Standard 6: Completed

Recommendations for improvement: no

Standard 7: Evaluation of CPD Activities

Monitoring and analysis of CPD evaluation of data is carried out by the Council on quality, which is a collegiate body acting in the field of planning and coordination of work on the formation and development of the quality management system (QMS) educational activities MAPE in order to prepare highly qualified specialists in demand on the domestic and foreign labor markets .

The EEC has received evidence that the accredited organization takes steps to update the content training programs for clinical disciplines in accordance with the update of clinical protocols of treatment and diagnosis.

To study the needs and interests of employers in the development of educational programs responsible MAPE employee annually collects applications from healthcare organizations, as well as hold meetings, joint sessions of round-table discussions with employers with the participation of stakeholders and individuals, as well as conducted a survey, interviewing audience.

Strengths Standard 7 of the external evaluation:

1. Embedded system process assessment and monitoring of additional education at the listeners and stakeholders.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply - 11 partially comply - 0 do not comply - 0

Standard 7: Completed

Recommendations for improvement: no

Standard 8. Organization

The EEC members studied documents on management and administration (regulations, organizational structure, job descriptions) and provided evidence that MAPE has sufficient staff, including 2019 units of 13 administrative staff, heads of departments, professional testing, instructor simulation center, IT engineer.

The faculty of the MAPE consists of leading professors of medical schools of Almaty, leading practical health care professionals involved both from practice and from the academic community - doctors and candidates of medical science, professors and associate professors.

In an interview with the leadership of MAPE members of the EEC, it was established that the main directions in ensuring financial and economic sustainability are as follows: strengthening the revenue side of MAPE by increasing the number of students; staffing optimization, i.e. The optimal ratio of the number of teachers and administrative staff. Incomes of MAPE are formed at the expense of receipts from paid types of educational activities, training and retraining of specialists.

Strengths Standard 8 of the external evaluation:

1. MAPE provides good governance to ensure the quality of supplementary education programs.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: comply - 8 partially comply 1, do not COMPLY - 0

Standard 8: Completed

Recommendations for improvement:

1) To expand international cooperation

Standard 9. Continuous Renewal

MAPE included in the Strategic Development Plan until 2022 measures to continuous improvement in terms of upgrade material fund procurement of modern equipment, the expansion of clinical training bases listeners, attracting professional and competent teachers and improving the competitiveness of services rendered by the organization in the field of further education. Evaluating the effectiveness of the results of the MAPE operations carried out on the basis of audience satisfaction. The optimization process MAPE activities carried out in accordance with international associations and NLA of the RoK, on the results of the continuing review of the medical literature, own experience in the health care system. MAPE employees improve their professional level, both within the country and in the far and near abroad to visiting master classes, international conferences and seminars with the participation of leading international experts and professors. MAPE employees trained and actively and effectively implement new educational technologies in the educational process in order to exchange experiences and improve the quality of education.

Strengths Standard 9 of the external evaluation:

1. In work conducted MAPE The procedure for the regular review and updating of the processes, organizational structure, content, outcomes / competences, assessment methods and educational environment of CPD programs in view of changes in the practical health and pharmacy needs, new regulatory documents, changes in society.

2. Implemented and applied the most popular educational concepts associated with modern innovative information technologies.

3. The actualization of educational programs conducted annually based on changes in international standards, NLA of the RoK, model curricula, clinical diagnostic protocols and treatment of RK.

4. MAPE each year to make additions to the strategic development plan.

WEC conclusions on the criteria: comply - 5 partially comply - 0 do not comply - 0

Standard 9: Completed

Recommendations for improvement: no

Thus, when analyzing the performance criteria Accreditation Standards found that fully complies - 115, complies partially - 4. All nine institutional standards accreditation performed.

5. Recommendations for Accreditation council of the ECAQA

EEC members came to unanimous opinion to recommend to the Accreditation Council to assign a status of Institutional Accreditation Organization, carrying out additional education "**Medical Academy of Postgraduate Education**" for 5 years.

Chairman of the EEC	Karibaeva Dina Orynbasarovna
Foreign expert	Tilekeeva Ulankul Muktarovna
National academic expert	Zhantelieva Lazzat Asanovna
Expert - representative of practical health care	Zhunusova Aynur Zhanalievna
Expert – representative of the Healthcare Professionals	Rakhmanov Marat Adilhanovich
ECAQA observer	Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna

Национальный академический эксперт	Жантлееси Лейтис Азатова	
Эксперт - представитель практического здравоохранения	Жульетта Айгер Жансегитова	
Эксперт - слушатель	Рахманна Марит Адыллыновна	
Наблюдатель ЕЦА	Умаров Мухамед Атадиллынович	

6. Рекомендации по улучшению деятельности ТОО «Медицинский Академический Последипломный Образование» в рамках институциональной аккредитации:

- 1) Содействовать организационно учебному процессу:
 - Сертифицировать преподавателей по активным методам обучения (ТНЛ, РНЛ, СНЛ) и тестологии (МСО);
 - Усилить работу с работодателями для улучшения содержания образовательных программ;
 - При пересмотре образовательных программ учитывать мнение слушателей согласно их мотивационным планам.
- 2) Усилить методическую работу:
 - Разработать и внедрить единую форму учебно-методического материала специальности и учебно-методической документации организации;
 - Разработать единые критерии оценки конечных результатов обучения слушателей;
- 3) Внедрить электронный документооборот;
- 4) Развить международное сотрудничество.

7. Рекомендации Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА

Члены ВЭК пришли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету аккредитовать ТОО «Медицинское академическое последипломное образование» в качестве организации аккредитованного образования сроком на 5 лет.

Председатель Высшей экспертной комиссии	Карабаева Дина Орыбасаровна	
Зарубежный эксперт	Тилеесса Умарова Мухтаровна	
Национальный академический эксперт	Жантлееси Лейтис Азатова	
Эксперт - представитель практического здравоохранения	Жульетта Айгер Жансегитова	
Эксперт - слушатель	Рахманна Марит Адыллыновна	
Наблюдатель ЕЦА	Умаров Мухамед Атадиллынович	

Quality profile and criteria for the external evaluation of the "Medical Academy of Postgraduate Education" LLP for compliance with the Standards for Institutional Accreditation of Organisations for Continuing Professional Development (CPD) for healthcare professionals and an overview of the strengths of each standard

Standard	Criteria for assessment	Assessment		
		Comply	Complies partially	Do not comply
1.	Mission and Outcomes	13	0	0
2.	Educational programme	17	2	0
3.	Assessment and Documentation	6	1	0
4.	The Healthcare Professionals (Individual professional development)	19	0	0
5	CPD Provision (Continuous Professional Development)	12	0	0
6.	Educational resources	24	0	0
7.	Evaluation of CPD Activities	11	0	0
8.	Organization	8	1	0
9.	Continuous Renewal	5	0	0
	Total:	115	4	0